



**UNITED STATES AIR FORCE ACADEMY
BOARD OF VISITORS**
WASHINGTON, DC 20330

31 January 2014

MEMORANDUM FOR SECRETARY OF DEFENSE

FROM: USAFA BoV
c/o AF/A1PT
1040 Air Force Pentagon
Washington, DC 20330-1040

SUBJECT: Annual Report, United States Air Force Academy Board of Visitors

Discussion Topics

As Chairman of the United States Air Force Academy (USAFA) Board of Visitors (BoV), I am pleased to submit this annual report for your consideration as required by Title 10, USC § 9355. The timeframe for this report is 1 January 2013 - 31 Dec 2013 and includes information from the BoV meetings in March 2013 and June 2013. The October 2013 scheduled meeting was cancelled due to the government shutdown.

During the past two meetings, the Board discussed and implemented two major items deemed essential to satisfactorily executing its Title 10 responsibilities of "... providing independent advice and recommendations on matters relating to the U.S. Air Force Academy."

The first item was the establishment of a single sub-committee at the March meeting titled the Strategic Sub-Committee comprised of the entire board. This was necessary in order for the board to properly address all USAFA BoV priority items in a timely and efficient manner due to the low attendance of the majority of Congressional BoV Members during a full days meeting. The BoV recommends the structure of the board be reviewed and altered to either permit Congressional BoV Member's staff to attend all BoV sessions to include closed sessions and or consider changing the composition of the board. In practice Congressional BoV Members find it nearly impossible to attend a full days meeting in Washington, D.C. and hardly attend, but for the Colorado delegation, the meetings at USAFA.

The second significant item was the creation and adoption of the BoV's Notational Issue Tracker allowing for the board to easily prioritize issues and track them by the date established, the action to be taken and their current status as opened or closed. The following are the BoV priorities from the March meeting that were annotated at June's 2013 meeting: New Air Force Academy Athletic Corporation (AFAAC), Sequestration and its impact on USAFA and Quality of USAFA graduates. The board recommends that SAF/MR, USAF/A1 and USAFA/CC utilize the BoV's Notational Issue Tracker to better realize, coordinate and support BoV priorities and actions required.

The Board also continues to focus on improving diversity at USAFA. The BoV believes there is a diversity issue at USAFA but not in the Cadet Wing, but in the permanent party AF officer diversity composition. The BoV understands that the AF has very poor retention rates of diversity and female USAFA graduates and this is reflected in the lack of diverse graduates and USAF officers in the Academy's permanent party. The BoV is alarmed that diverse cadets may be looking ahead in their AF careers to see that there are very few diverse officers serving on the USAFA faculty, in senior AF leadership positions and as operational USAF Commanders. Additionally, USAFA diversity graduate officers are neither well represented nor attend select graduate schools and rated career fields after graduation. Also and surprising to the BoV is that the diversity mix of each entering USAFA class is being determined with seemingly no input nor policy guidelines from AF Senior Leadership and is being left to the Director of Admissions at USAFA. When reviewing the Cadet Wing we found that its diversity composition has been very consistent over the last 5 - 7 years: African-American at 6%, Hispanic-American at 8%, Asian-American-Pacific-Islander at 9%, Native-Americans at 1%, Caucasians at 76%, and Females and Recruited Athletes at 22%. The board recommends that USAF monitor its USAFA diversity graduate Officer community for retention efforts and to better understand why these populations do not choose nor attend rated service career fields upon graduation.

At June's meeting the board also reviewed USAFA's Sexual Assault Prevention and Response Program and the 2012 Service Academy Gender Relations Survey reporting:

- Majority of offenders were fellow cadets (93% for women, 83% for men)
- Few reported the incident (6% for women, 0% for men)
- Most frequently cited reasons for not reporting:
 - Not important enough to report (81% for women, 84% for men)
 - Took care of it themselves (70% for women, 63% for men)

Additionally, the BoV spent considerable time reviewing the Annual Report on Sexual Harassment and Violence at the Military Service Academies Academic Program Year 2012-2013 and specifically agrees with and will continue to monitor the following:

- USAFA implemented the Air Force Special Victims Counsel program mid-way through APY 12-13, providing confidential legal advice, assistance, and representation to victims of sexual assault. USAFA should continue to focus on these efforts, take steps to improve central coordination of their initiatives, and ensure the SAPR staff is resourced appropriately and able to provide consistent victim support and services.
- During APY 12-13, USAFA focused on fostering a culture of commitment to USAFA standards and where cadets can develop their leadership skills and the Commandant issued his Vector for 2013, in which he challenged cadets to "do better" in adhering to USAFA standards.
- The USAFA Department of Behavioral Sciences and Leadership faculty embarked on a two-step process to improve "Respect for Human Dignity" (RFHD) at USAFA. RFHD is defined by USAFA as "those behaviors and attitudes of professionalism and equity that

demonstrate an ability to interact with another person in a way that is mature, considers another person's basic rights, understands their perspective, and demonstrates fair, equitable treatment."

- An influential element detracting from USAFA's efforts to foster a culture of dignity and respect are members of the Cadet Wing that perpetuate attitudes and behavior that disregard academy policies and practices and engage in gender-related misbehavior and misconduct, targeting fellow female cadets as the focus of crude and offensive language and sexist comments.
- The Department encourages USAFA to review and strengthen leadership of cadet groups, teams, and clubs in such a way that encourages mentoring and consultation between organizational leaders. Including a coach or faculty sponsor on all formal cadet group communication distribution lists allows greater supervision of groups, teams, and clubs.

The board recommends that current USAF and USAFA Leadership re-visit and review The Fowler Report - Report of the Panel to Review Sexual Misconduct Allegations at the U.S. Air Force Academy specifically:

- The regular turnover of Air Force and Academy leadership, together with inconsistent command supervision and a lack of meaningful and effective external oversight, undermined efforts to alter the culture of the Academy.
- The Panel recommends that the Air Force extend the tour length of the Superintendent to four years and the tour length of the Commandant of Cadets to three years in order to provide for greater continuity and stability in Academy leadership.
- Operate more like a corporate board of directors with regularly organized committees charged with distinctive responsibilities (e.g., academic affairs, student life, athletics, etc.). The Board should meet not less than four times per year, with at least two of those meetings at the Academy. To the extent practical, meetings should include at least one full day of meaningful participation and should be scheduled so as to provide the fullest participation by Congressional members. Board members must have unfettered access to Academy grounds and cadets, to include attending classes and meeting with cadets informally and privately.
- Receive candid and complete disclosure by the Secretary of the Air Force and the Academy Superintendent of all institutional problems, including but not limited to, all gender related matters, cadet surveys and information related to culture and climate and incidents of sexual harassment and sexual assaults.

- Changing the composition of the Board to include fewer Congressional (and, therefore, more Presidential-appointed) members, more women and minority individuals and at least two Academy graduates
- Requiring that any individual who accepts an appointment as a Board member does, thereby, pledge full commitment to attend each meeting of the Board, and to carry out all of the duties and responsibilities of a Board member, to the fullest extent practical
- Terminating any Board member's appointment who fails to attend or fully participate in two successive Board meetings, unless granted prior excusal for good cause by the Board Chairman
- Providing clear oversight authority of the Board over the Academy, and direct that, in addition to the reports of its annual meetings required to be furnished to the President, it shall submit those reports and such other reports it prepares, to the Chairmen of the Senate and House Armed Services Committees, the Secretary of Defense and the Secretary of the Air Force, in order to identify all matters of the Board's concerns with or about the Air Force Academy and to recommend appropriate action thereon

Finally, the BoV discussed the AF Chief of Staff's direction to USAFA/CC regarding the development of a USAFA Second Lieutenant and specifically how best to answer CSAF query about quality of USAFA graduates? The board recommends that USAFA address the following in its analyses:

- What are the metrics for how we know we are educating future leaders?
- Who are we asking to assess?
- How does it compare to other sources?
- Is USAFA cost effective?
- Are we assessing fairly across commissioning sources?

Appointments

The President re-appointed Lt Gen (Ret.) Jameson and Maj Gen (Ret.) Harris to another 3-year term on the Board. The Board re-elected me and Lt Gen (ret) Jameson to a second year as the Board of Visitors Chair and Vice Chair, respectively. With the on-going realignment within the SAF/MR and AF/A1 community, the Board's Designated Federal Officer, Ms. Francine Blackmon, has departed the Air Force and has been replaced by Ms. Tina Strickland.

The BoV discussed the effects of sequestration on the Academy during both the March 2013 and June 2013 meetings. Lt Gen Gould discussed the reduction in training opportunities this would have on the cadets and their development toward becoming a competent leaders in tomorrow's Air Force.

Vacancies on the Board of Visitors

During the year, it came to my attention that Congresswomen Loretta Sanchez was appointed to the United States Military Academy's Board of Visitors leaving a Speaker of the House vacancy on the USAFA Board of Visitors. We also have one Vice Presidential appointment vacancy that the Executive Secretary within the AF/A1 is working to have filled.

The BoV is fully engaged in its charter to provide oversight of USAFA on behalf of the President of the United States and yourself.

Respectfully,


ALFREDO A. SANDOVAL
Chair, USAFA Board of Visitors

cc:

Chairman, Committee on Armed Services of the Senate

Chairman, Committee on Armed Services of the House of Representatives

Chief of Staff, U.S. Air Force

Deputy Chief of Staff of the Air Force, Manpower and Personnel

Superintendent, USAFA

Members of USAFA Board of Visitors

Designated Federal Officer, USAFA Board of Visitors

Executive Secretary, USAFA Board of Visitor

TABLE OF CONTENTS

USAFA Board of Visitors Membership, Composition, and Terms	7
Charter (USAFA Board of Visitors)	8
Bylaws (USAFA Board of Visitors)	12
APPENDIX 1 - March 2013 Minutes of the Quarterly Meeting of the USAFA BoV	19
APPENDIX 2 - June 2013 Minutes of the Quarterly Meeting of the USAFA BoV	28

**USAFA BOARD OF VISITORS
MEMBERSHIP, COMPOSITION, AND TERMS
(As of 1 January 2014)**

	Years on the Board	Term Expires
<u>APPOINTED BY THE PRESIDENT OF THE UNITED STATES*</u>		
Mr. Arlen Jameson-Vice Chair	2010-Present	2016
Ms. Marcelite Harris	2010-Present	2016
Mr. Thomas L. McKiernan (USAFA '71)	2011-Present	2014
Mr. Fletcher Wiley (USAFA '65)	2011-Present	2014
Ms. Paula Thornhill (USAFA '80)	2012-Present	2014
Ms. Sue Hoppin	2012-Present	2014
<u>APPOINTED BY THE VICE PRESIDENT OF THE UNITED STATES</u>		
U.S. Senator Lindsey Graham (R-SC)	2011-Present	Resigns, relieved, or no longer in the office
U.S. Senator John Hoeven (R-ND)	2011-Present	Resigns, relieved, or no longer in the office
Vacant	Vacant	Resigns, relieved, or no longer in the office
<u>APPOINTED BY THE SPEAKER OF THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES</u>		
U.S. Representative Doug Lamborn (R-CO)	2007-Present	Resigns, relieved, or no longer in the office
U.S. Representative Jared Polis (D-CO)	2009-Present	Resigns, relieved, or no longer in the office
Mr. Alfredo Sandoval (USAFA '82) - Chair	2010-Present	Resigns or relieved
Vacant	Vacant	Resigns, relieved, or no longer in the office
<u>APPOINTED BY THE CHAIRMAN, ARMED SERVICES COMMITTEE</u>		
U.S. Senator Michael Bennet (D-CO)	2011-Present	Resigns, relieved, or no longer in the office
U.S. Representative Niki Tsongas (D-MA)	2008-Present	Resigns, relieved, or no longer in the office

.....
* Presidential appointees serve for three years; however, per Title 10, they continue to serve on the Board until replaced.

Charter
Board of Visitors of the U.S. Air Force Academy

1. Committee's Official Designation: The Committee shall be known as the Board of Visitors of the U.S. Air Force Academy (hereinafter referred to as "the Board").
2. Authority: The Secretary of Defense, under the provisions of 10 United States Code (U.S.C.) § 9355, the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) of 1972 (5 U.S.C., Appendix, as amended), and 41 CFR § 102-3.50(a) (required by statute), established the Board.
3. Objectives and Scope of Activities: The Board shall provide independent advice and recommendations on matters relating to the U.S. Air Force Academy (hereinafter referred to as "the Academy"), as set out in paragraph four below.
4. Description of Duties: The Board shall provide to the Secretary of Defense and the Deputy Secretary of Defense, through the Secretary of the Air Force, and to the Committee on Armed Services of the Senate and the Committee on Armed Services of the House of Representatives independent advice and recommendations on the morale, discipline, and social climate, the curriculum, instruction, physical equipment, fiscal affairs, academic methods, and other matters relating to the Academy that the Board decides to consider. The Board shall recommend appropriate action.

The Board shall prepare a semiannual report containing its views and recommendations pertaining to the Academy, based on its meeting since the last such report and any other considerations it determines relevant. Each such report shall be submitted concurrently to the Secretary of Defense, through the Secretary of the Air Force, and to the Committee on Armed Services of the Senate and the Committee on Armed Services of the House of Representatives.

5. Agency or Official to Whom the Committee Reports: The Board shall report to the Secretary of Defense and Deputy Secretary of Defense, through the Secretary of the Air Force, and to the Committee on Armed Services of the Senate and the Committee on Armed Services of the House of Representatives. Pursuant to DoD policy, the Secretary of the Air Force may act upon the Board's advice and recommendations.
6. Support: The DoD, through the Secretary of the Air Force, shall provide support, as deemed necessary, for the performance of the Board's functions, and shall ensure compliance with the requirements of FACA, the Government in the Sunshine Act of 1976 (5 U.S.C. § 552b) (hereinafter referred to as "the Government in the Sunshine Act"), governing Federal statutes and regulations, and established DoD policies/procedures.

The Secretary of the Air Force, through the Superintendent of the Academy, shall ensure that the Board has access to the Academy grounds and the cadets, faculty, staff, and other personnel of the Academy for the purposes of the duties of the Board. The Secretary of the Air Force and the Superintendent of the Academy shall also provide the Board candid and complete disclosure, consistent with applicable laws concerning disclosure of information, with respect to institutional problems.²

7. Estimated Annual Operating Costs and Staff Years: The estimated annual operating cost, to include travel, meetings, and contract support, is approximately \$200,000.00. The estimated annual personnel costs to the DoD are 2.5 full-time equivalents.

8. Designated Federal Officer (DFO): The Board's DFO, pursuant to DoD policy, shall be a full-time or permanent part-time DoD employee, and shall be appointed in accordance with established DoD policies and procedures.

In addition, the Board's DFO is required to be in attendance at all Board and Subcommittee meetings for the entire duration of each and every meeting. However, in the absence of the Board's DFO, a properly approved Alternate DFO, duly appointed to the Board according to DoD policies/procedures, shall attend the entire duration of the Board or Subcommittee meeting. The DFO, or the Alternate DFO, shall call all of the Board's and Subcommittee's meetings; prepare and approve all meeting agendas; adjourn any meeting when the DFO, or Alternate DFO, determines adjournment to be in the public interest or required by governing regulations or DoD policies/procedures; and chair meetings when directed to do so by the Secretary of the Air Force.

9. Estimated Number and Frequency of Meetings: The Board shall meet at the call of the Board's DFO, in consultation with the Board's Chairperson. The estimated number of Board meetings is at least four per year, with at least two of those meetings taking place at the Academy.

10. Duration: The need for this advisory function is on a continuing basis; however, this charter is subject to renewal every two years.

11. Termination: The Board shall terminate upon rescission of 10 U.S.C. § 9355.

12. Membership and Designation: The Board, pursuant to 10 U.S.C. § 9355 (a) and (b)(2), shall be constituted annually and composed of 15 members. The Board membership shall include:

- a. Six persons designated by the President, at least two of whom shall be graduates of the Academy;
- b. The Chairperson of the Committee on Armed Services of the House of Representatives, or designee;
- c. Four persons designated by the Speaker of the House of Representatives, three of whom shall be members of the House of Representatives and the fourth of whom may not be a member of the House of Representatives;
- d. The Chairperson of the Committee on Armed Services of the Senate, or designee; and

Three other members of the Senate designated by the Vice President or the President pro tempore of the Senate, two of whom are members of the Committee on Appropriations of the Senate.

Board members designated by the President shall serve for three years each, except that any member whose term of office has expired shall continue to serve until a successor is appointed. In addition, the President shall designate persons each year to succeed the members whose terms expire that year.

If a member of the Board dies, resigns, or is terminated, a successor shall be designated for the unexpired portion of the term by the official who designated the member.

The Board members shall select the Board Chairperson and Vice Chairperson from the total membership.

If a member of the Board fails to attend two successive Board meetings, except in a case in which an absence is approved in advance for good cause by the Board Chairperson, such failure shall be grounds for termination from membership on the Board, pursuant to 10 U.S.C. § 9355(c)(2)(A) (hereinafter referred to as "absenteeism provision").

Termination of membership on the Board pursuant to the absenteeism provision, in the case of a member of the Board who is not a member of Congress, may be made by the Board's Chairperson and, in the case of a member of the Board who is a member of Congress, may be made only by the official who designated the member. When a member of the board is subject to termination from membership on the Board under the absenteeism provision, the Board's Chairperson shall notify the official who designated the member. Upon receipt of such a notification with respect to a member of the Board who is a member of Congress, the official who designated the member shall take such action as that official considers appropriate.

Board members who are full-time or permanent part-time Federal Officers or employees shall be appointed as regular government employees or *ex officio* as appropriate. Board members designated by the President or the Congress, who are not full-time or permanent part-time Federal officers or employees, shall be appointed to serve as special government employees under the authority of 5 U.S.C. § 3109.

With the exception of travel and per diem for official travel, Board members serve without compensation.

The Board, pursuant to 10 U.S.C § 9355 (g), may, upon approval by the Secretary of the Air Force, call in advisers for consultation, in accordance with 5 U.S.C § 3109. These advisers shall, with the exception of travel and per diem for official travel, serve without compensation.

13. Subcommittees: The Department, when necessary and consistent with the Board's mission and DoD policies and procedures, may establish Subcommittees, task groups, or working groups to support the Board. Establishment of Subcommittees will be based upon written determination, to include terms of reference, by the Secretary of Defense, the Deputy Secretary of Defense, or the Secretary of the Air Force as the Board's sponsor.

Such Subcommittees or workgroups shall not work independently of the chartered Board, and shall report all their recommendations and advice solely to the Board for full deliberation and discussion. Subcommittees, task forces, working groups have no authority to make decisions and recommendations, verbally or in writing, on behalf of the chartered Board; nor can any Subcommittee or its members update or report, verbally or in writing, directly to the DoD or any Federal officers or employees.

All Subcommittee members shall be appointed by the Secretary of Defense according to governing DoD policies/procedures, even if the member in question is already a Board member. Such individuals shall be appointed to serve as experts and consultants under the authority of 5 U.S.C. § 3109, and shall serve as special government employees. Subcommittee members, with the approval

of the Secretary of Defense, may serve a term of service on the Subcommittee of one-to-four years; however, no Subcommittee member shall serve more than two consecutive terms of service unless otherwise authorized by the Secretary of Defense. All Subcommittee appointments must be renewed on an annual basis. With the exception of travel and per diem, Subcommittee members shall serve without compensation.

Each Subcommittee member is appointed to provide advice on behalf of the government on the basis of his or her best judgment without representing any particular point of view and in a manner that is free from conflict of interest.

All Subcommittees, task forces, and working groups shall operate under the provisions of the FACA, the Government in the Sunshine Act, governing Federal statutes and regulations, and governing DoD policies/procedures.

14. Recordkeeping: The records of the Board and its Subcommittees shall be handled according to section 2, General Records Schedule 26 and governing DoD policies and procedures. These records shall be available for public inspection and copying, subject to the Freedom of Information Act of 1966 (5 U.S.C. § 552, as amended).

15. Filing Date: November 26, 2012

UNITED STATES AIR FORCE ACADEMY

BOARD OF VISITORS

BYLAWS

ARTICLE I: AUTHORITY AND PURPOSE

The United States Air Force Academy Board of Visitors (the Board) is governed by Title 10, U.S. Code, § 9355, *Board of Visitors*. It is an oversight board in the executive branch of the government established to inquire into the morale, discipline, social climate, curriculum, instruction, physical equipment, fiscal affairs, academic methods, and other matters relating to the Academy that the Board decides to consider.

Unlike a corporate board of directors, this Board cannot be directive in its oversight role. The Board is an advisory board charged with providing independent advice and recommendations on matters relating to the U.S. Air Force Academy. The Board shall be responsible for advising the Superintendent (and, in turn, the Chief of Staff, the Secretary of the Air Force and the Secretary of Defense) by making recommendations on significant matters relating to the Academy.

The Board may request, without restriction, information, facts, and briefings in support of its role to oversee operations of the Air Force Academy.

The Secretary of the Air Force (SecAF) and the Superintendent of the Academy shall provide the Board candid and complete disclosure, consistent with applicable laws concerning disclosure of information, with respect to institutional problems.

ARTICLE II: RULES OF CONSTRUCTION

Nothing in these bylaws shall be construed to supersede the provisions of the public laws of the United States, the Board Charter, or any Air Force or Department of Defense regulation, directive, or instruction. Nothing in these bylaws shall be construed to create liability in any Board member for any action taken by the Board or the Air Force Academy.

ARTICLE III: MEMBERSHIP

Section 1 - Board of Visitors: By law, the Board of Visitors of the United States Air Force Academy is constituted annually and consists of:

- a. Six persons designated by the President. At least two of these members shall be graduates of the Academy.

b. The chairman of the Committee on Armed Services of the House of Representatives, or his designee.

c. Four persons designated by the Speaker of the House of Representatives, three of whom shall be members of the House of Representatives and the fourth of whom may not be a member of the House of Representatives.

d. The chairman of the Committee on Armed Services of the Senate, or his designee.

e. Three other members of the Senate designated by the Vice President or the President pro tempore of the Senate, two of whom are members of the Committee on Appropriations of the Senate.

Upon announcement of a Board member's replacement, the DFO will notify the Chair of the membership change. The Board Chair will make proper notification to the member that his/her replacement has been appointed.

Section 2 - Term of Service: By law, the persons designated by the President serve for three years each except that any member whose term of office has expired shall continue to serve until his successor is designated. The President shall designate persons each year to succeed the members designated by the President whose terms expire that year. If a member of the Board dies or resigns or is terminated as a member of the board, a successor shall be designated for the unexpired portion of the term by the official who designated the member.

Section 3 - Service Expectation: The Board is a working board and its members are expected to attend all meetings and to participate in the activities of the Board. Board members have the duty to make constructive recommendations to ensure the mission of the Academy is appropriately met. If a member of the Board fails to attend two successive Board meetings, except in a case in which an absence is approved, for good cause, by the Board Chair, such failure shall be grounds for termination from membership on the Board. A person designated for membership on the Board shall be provided notice of the provisions of this paragraph at the time of such appointment.

When a member of the Board is subject to termination from membership on the Board, the Board Chair shall notify the official who designated the member. Upon receipt of such a notification with respect to a member of the Board who is a member of Congress, the official who designated the member shall take such action as that official considers appropriate. In the case of a member of the Board who is not a member of Congress, termination of membership may be made by the Board Chair.

Section 4 - Officers:

a. The officers of the Board are the Chair and the Vice Chair, who shall be elected annually by the Board.

b. The Chair and Vice Chair shall serve for a period of one year commencing with the beginning of the following calendar year and until their re-election or the election of their successors.

c. The Vice Chair shall preside at the meeting in the absence of the Chair, or if the Chair resigns or is unable to perform the functions of the office because of illness or death.

Section 5 - Subcommittees:

The SecAF may, when necessary and consistent with the Board's mission and DoD policies and procedures, create subcommittees of the parent committee (the Board). In order to assist the SecAF, the Board Chair may recommend the establishment of subcommittees and their membership, size, focus, and duration to the SecAF through the DFO. Subcommittees may be used to conduct research or gather information for the use of the entire board. As is consistent with the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) and applicable DoD policies, subcommittee meetings will not be open to the public, but each Subcommittee Chair shall outbrief the Board during an open session to summarize the subcommittee's work. No individual Board member or subcommittee shall take official action for the Board unless authorized to do so. Subcommittees shall be responsible for reviewing and making recommendations to the full board on subjects the board shall designate. Each subcommittee will be assigned a USAFA subject matter expert as a point of contact to assist with collection of any necessary information.

Section 6 - Designated Federal Officer: The Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Air Force for Force Management Integration (SAF/MRM) shall serve as the Designated Federal Officer required by section 10 (e), of the FACA (5 U.S.C. Appendix, 10(e)), and shall have the duties and responsibilities imposed by sections 10 (e) and (f), FACA (5 U.S.C. Appendix, 10 (e) and (f)). As part of those duties, SAF/MRM shall attend all meetings of the Board and may exercise the authority to adjourn any meeting of the Board, if determined to be in the public interest. As the DFO, SAF/MRM is also responsible for approving any meeting of the USAFA BoV, to include its agenda. The SAF/MRM Assistant Deputy for Officer Accessions and Programs will serve as the alternate DFO. Additional alternate DFOs will be appointed, as required by DoD policy, to attend subcommittee meetings.

Section 7 - Executive Secretary: The Executive Secretary shall be appointed by the Deputy Chief of Staff, Manpower & Personnel (AF/A1). The Executive Secretary shall abide by the provisions set forth in the Federal Advisory Committee Act to include ensuring timely notice of each meeting is published in the Federal Register; and shall ensure, subject to Section 522, Title 5, United States Code, the records, reports, transcripts, minutes, appendixes, working papers, drafts, studies, agenda, or other documents which were made available to or prepared for or by the Board of Visitors are made available for public inspection and copying at a single location. Additionally, the Executive Secretary shall:

a. Prepare detailed minutes of each meeting of the USAFA BoV, to include a record of the persons present, a complete and accurate description of matters discussed and conclusions reached, and inclusion of any subcommittee updates/reports.

b. Will assist chairs of any BoV subcommittee with any necessary information and administrative support.

c. Maintain the BoV bylaws.

ARTICLE IV: MEETINGS

Section 1 - Designated Board Meeting Dates: The Board should meet at least four times a year, with at least two of those meetings at the Academy. Other than for those meetings required to convene at USAFA, meetings of the Board may be conducted in whole or in part through electronic means. The Board or its members may make other visits to the Academy in connection with the duties of the Board. Board meetings should last at least one full day. Board members shall have access to the Academy grounds and the cadets, faculty, staff, and other personnel of the Academy for the purposes of the duties of the Board.

Section 2 - Notice of Meetings of the Board of Visitors:

a. Notice of the scheduled or special meetings of the Board shall be published in the Federal Register in accordance with the FACA (5 U.S.C. App, 10 (a) (2)). The notice shall be published at least 15 calendar days before the date of the meeting, except that a shorter period may be authorized in an emergency situation, with the prior approval of the Department of Defense Committee Management Officer (Para E3.12.9, DoDI 5105.04). The notice shall state the time, place, and purpose of the meeting and set forth a summary of the agenda. The notice shall also state whether the meeting will be open to the public.

b. All meetings of the Board shall be open to the public. In those instances where the Chair recommends certain sessions (e.g., sessions involving personal information protected by the Privacy Act of 1974) of a scheduled meeting, or the entire meeting, should be closed to the public in accordance with provisions of Section 552b(c), Title 5, United States Code, the Chair will notify the Executive Secretary. The Executive Secretary will staff the request for a closed session through the General Counsel for approval by the CMO (SAF/AA).

Section 3 - Agenda: Prior to each meeting, the Executive Secretary shall prepare a draft meeting agenda after consultation with the Board Chair, the Superintendent of the Air Force Academy, the DFO, and others as deemed appropriate. The DFO will have final approval of meeting agendas. Agenda topics for convened meetings will include:

a. Review of the United States Air Force Academy strategic plans, objectives, and performance metrics.

b. Review and assess goals, objectives, initiatives and performance.

c. Update milestones and accomplishments from independent audits that have received leadership attention.

d. Those matters deferred from previous Board meetings for consideration at the next scheduled meeting.

e. Those matters proposed for discussion by the Academy or the Department of the Air Force that are agreed to by the Board Chair.

f. Those matters proposed for discussion by Board members, provided the Board Chair agrees to them and the Executive Secretary has reasonable time to coordinate Academy and Department of the Air Force views on the proposed matters.

g. The following agenda items will be discussed on an as needed basis:

1) Initiatives that incur significant costs to the Federal Government but where the benefits are not readily linked with established Academy strategic goals, objectives, or performance metrics.

2) Initiatives connected to broad cultural change that will take concerted effort from Academy and AF leadership.

h. At the conclusion of each Board meeting, the members shall be apprised of tentative dates and locations for subsequent Board meetings.

i. Any member of the Board may make special visits to the United States Air Force Academy, in addition to those described herein, in connection with the duties of the Board or to consult with the Superintendent.

Section 4 - Quorum: No business may be transacted at a meeting of the Board unless a quorum of six members is present. Participation in a Board meeting through electronic means suffices for attendance for the purpose of obtaining a quorum. In other words, regardless of the forum (a face-to-face meeting, an electronic-based meeting, or a combination of both), at least six members must participate for business to be transacted.

Section 5 - Parliamentary Procedure: Except as provided herein or through decisions of the Board, *Robert's Rules of Order* shall apply in all proceedings and discussions of the Board of Visitors and its subcommittees. All questions shall be decided by a majority vote of the members present (in person or by electronic means). Each member shall have one vote. Voting may be done by mail ballot or by telephone call, electronic mail, or other means designated by the Board, the Chair, or subcommittee chairmen.

Section 6 - Participation of Congressional Staffers: Congressional Members may have a staffer from their office attend open sessions of BoV meetings and Subcommittee meetings. The Staffers are allowed to sit at the table below BoV Members (space permitting) and may share their Congressional Members' inputs to discussions. In accordance with FACA guidance, they will not attend closed sessions. Staffers do not count as part of a quorum and they may not vote on their Members' behalf (see Section 8--Proxy Voting below). Staffers' travel costs are not covered by the Air Force.

Section 7 - Participation of the Public: Members of the public attending open meetings and briefings of the Board may, upon approval by the Chair, be allowed to present questions from the floor or speak to an issue under discussion by the Board. Any member of the public shall also be

permitted to file a written statement with the Board. Written statements must address the following: the issue, discussion, and a recommended course of action. The proposed statement will be submitted to the DFO. However, if a written statement is not received at least 10 days before the first day of the scheduled meeting then it may not be provided to, or considered by, the BoV until its next open meeting. The DFO will review all timely submissions with the BoV Chair and ensure they are provided to members of the BoV before the meeting that is the subject of the proposed written statement. If, after review of timely submitted written comments, the BoV Chair and DFO deem appropriate, they may choose to invite the submitter of the written comments to orally present their issue during an open portion of the BoV meeting subject to the submitter's request. The DFO and BoV Chair may, if desired, allot a specific amount of time for members of the public to present their issue for BoV review and discussion. Direct questioning of BoV members or meeting participants by the public is not permitted except with the approval of the DFO and Chair.

Section 8 - Proxy Voting: Proxy voting is not allowed. A letter from an absent member presenting a position on a particular matter under consideration by the Board shall not constitute a vote on the matter, but the letter may be read to the Board by the Chair and shall be appended to the Minutes of the Board.

Section 9 - Special Meetings: The Chair may propose a special Board meeting for good cause or upon written request of at least a majority of the Board members.

Section 10 - Minutes of the Board of Visitors: Detailed minutes of any meeting held by the Board shall be kept by the Executive Secretary and shall contain a record of persons present, a complete and accurate description of matters discussed and conclusions reached, if any, and copies of all reports received, issued, or approved by the Board. The statement of members will appear only in summation form, except any member may exercise the right to have views incorporated verbatim in the minutes. Minutes shall be compiled by the Executive Secretary and certified by the Chair of the Board. Subject to 5 U.S.C. Section 552, the records, reports, transcripts, minutes and other documents pertaining to the Board's activity will be available for public inspection in the office of the Executive Secretary.

Section 11 - Reports: The Board shall prepare a semiannual report containing its views and recommendations pertaining to the Academy, based on its meetings since the last such report and any other considerations it determines relevant. Each such report shall be submitted concurrently to the Secretary of Defense, through the Secretary of the Air Force, and to the Committee on Armed Services of the Senate and the Committee on Armed Services of the House of Representatives.

a. The Chair shall be responsible for the preparation of the reports and the members of the Board of Visitors should approve the reports by a majority vote.

b. The Secretary and Chief of Staff of the Air Force, as well as the Superintendent of the Academy, will receive a copy of the approved reports.

ARTICLE V: GENERAL

Section 1 - United States Air Force Academy: The United States Air Force Academy, without restriction, will provide to the Board information, briefings, and facts in preparation for meetings in support of its role to oversee operations of the United States Air Force Academy, and will provide Board members access to the Academy grounds and cadets, to include attending classes and meeting with cadets informally and privately. Also, the Superintendent of the Air Force Academy will ensure BoV members receive candid and complete disclosure of all institutional problems, to include cadet and faculty surveys, and any information related to the culture and climate of the Academy.

Section 2 - United States Air Force: The Air Force, as an executive branch department, is responsible for implementing policies, law, regulations, and statutes concerned with the Academy, as well as achieving the desired outcomes. This is done through the chain of command that proceeds from the Secretary of the Air Force to the Chief of Staff of the Air Force, and then to the Superintendent of the Air Force Academy.

Section 3 - Amendments of Changes to the Bylaws of the Board of Visitors: The bylaws will be reviewed annually. Amendments or changes to the bylaws of the Board of Visitors may be suggested to the Board Chair, in writing, by any member as an Agenda item at a scheduled Board meeting not less than 30 days prior to the meeting. The assent of at least two-thirds of the members of the Board is necessary to amend or change these bylaws.

Section 4 - Reimbursement: While performing duties as a member of the Board, each member of the Board and each adviser shall be reimbursed under Government travel regulations for travel expenses.

(Approved 10 May 2013)

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING

OF THE

BOARD OF VISITORS

UNITED STATES AIR FORCE ACADEMY

15 & 16 March 2013

APPROVED:

by the USAFA BOARD OF VISITORS

14 June 2013

INDEX

TOPIC

PAGE

March 15 & 16, 2013

Attendance.....	3
Opening Comments	4

BRIEFINGS

Athletic Department Update.....	4
Superintendent's Update.....	5
Character Update.....	7
Impact of NDAA Requirements.....	7
Subcommittee Out-Briefs.....	8

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
BOARD OF VISITORS (BoV)**

UNITED STATES AIR FORCE ACADEMY (USAFA)

The Chair opened the March USAFA Board of Visitors meeting on March 15, 2013 and concluded the meeting on March 16, 2013. The meeting was held at USAFA in Colorado Springs, CO.

ATTENDANCE

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Alfredo Sandoval (Chair)
Lt General (Ret) Arlen "Dirk" Jameson (Vice Chair)
Representative Doug Lamborn (R-CO)
Maj General (Ret) Marcelite Harris
Dr. Thomas McKiernan
Mr. Fletcher "Flash" Wiley
Brig Gen (Ret) Paula Thornhill
Ms. Sue Hoppin

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Senator Lindsey Graham (R- SC)
Senator Michael Bennet (D-CO)
Senator John Hoeven (R-ND)
Representative Loretta Sanchez (D-CA)
Representative Niki Tsongas (D-MA)
Representative Jared Polis (D-CO)

AIR FORCE SENIOR STAFF:

Honorable Daniel Ginsberg, SAF/MR
Lt Gen Darrell Jones, AF/A1
Ms. Francine Blackmon, SES, SAF/MRM -- USAFA BoV Designated Federal Official (DFO)

USAFA SENIOR STAFF:

Lt Gen Michael Gould, Superintendent
Brig Gen Greg Lengyel, Commandant of Cadets
Brig Gen Dana Born, Dean of the Faculty
Col Tamara Rank, Vice Superintendent
Dr. Hans Mueh, Director of Athletics
Col Kim Hawthorne, Director of Plans, Policies and Assessments
Col Carolyn Benyshek, Director of Admissions
Col Kabrena Rodda, USAFA Prep School Commander
Col Paul Barzler, USAFA Judge Advocate
Col Stella (Reni) Renner, Vice Commandant Culture and Climate
Col Scott Dierlam, United States Air Force Academy Liaison
Mr. Dave Cannon, Director of Strategic Communications
Dr. Adis Vila, Chief Diversity Officer
Lt Col Frank Verdugo, Director Finance Management and Comptroller

BoV EXECUTIVE SECRETARY:
Lt Col LaMont Coleman (AF/A1PT)

OPENING COMMENTS

The Board convened and the Chairman, Mr. Alfredo Sandoval, called the meeting to order at 2:33 p.m. The DFO was present and enough members were in attendance to establish a quorum. Mr. Sandoval announced that the Board would review the Academy's infrastructure and maintenance needs, discuss cadet character and leadership development, and determine the appropriate mix of subcommittees during the 2 day meeting. Mr. Sandoval shared that the new BoV members, Brig Gen (Ret) Paula Thornhill and Ms. Sue Hoppin would be sworn in by Mr. Daniel Ginsberg.

Next, Mr. Sandoval asked if the Board had an opportunity to review the December meeting minutes. After a motion to vote, the Board unanimously approved the December meeting minutes with the incorporation of a recommended change from Lt Gen (ret) Dirk Jameson.

Mr. Sandoval reminded the Board of the interring ceremony for Mr. Charles V. Bush, USAFA class of 1963 on 17 March 2013. Next, Mr. Sandoval asked the Board to review the upcoming BoV dates. He noted that the next meeting would be 13-14 June in Washington, DC, and tentatively 13-14 September at the Academy and 5-6 December in Washington, DC.

(The open session dismissed at 2:43 p.m.)

ATHLETIC DEPARTMENT UPDATE

Mr. Sandoval welcomed the Board back into session and pointed out that a member of the press was in attendance.

Dr. Mueh began the athletic department briefing with an update on diversity within the department. He shared that the athletic department is comprised of military, civilian, contractors, and GS employees. Dr. Mueh stated that the department has increased the number of female personnel by 1% over CY 2011 and hired 12 new individuals to the athletic department; 42% of which are women or minorities. Dr. Mueh shared that 3 new African American and 1 Hispanic coach/instructor were hired but reiterated that USAFA remains focused on diversity within the department and will continue to try to migrate the athletic department demographics to be more representative of our country.

Next, Dr. Mueh pointed out that the USAFA contract coaches are more diverse because the Academy has greater control over hiring. Mr. Sandoval inquired on the typical contract length for a USAFA coach and Dr. Mueh shared that typically coaches are on contract for 3 to 5 years.

Dr. Mueh shared details on the developmental opportunities provided to personnel within the Athletic Department and commented that six individuals are currently working on their PhDs. Dr. Thornhill asked for the completion rate in their degrees and Dr. Mueh responded that so far there has been a 100% completion rate. Dr. Mueh noted that many of the short term developmental opportunities and conferences have been put on hold because of sequestration.

Maj Gen Harris asked about coaching certifications and licenses and Dr. Mueh explained that each sport has a governing body, some international, which certify individual sports. Next, Dr. Mueh provided the

Board a snapshot of the Division I athletic demographics. He shared that there are approximately 827 athletes, a 36% increase in total intercollegiate athletes over AY 2011-2012. Mr. Sandoval commented that 13% of the athletic department is African-American which is twice the percentage of African Americans within the cadet wing. Dr. Mueh confirmed the numbers and Maj Gen Harris inquired on how those cadets perform academically. Dr. Mueh replied that graduation and attrition numbers for minorities are comparable to other non-minority cadets.

Dr. Mueh shared potential sequestration impacts on the USAFA athletic department and Mr. Ginsberg highlighted the overall issue that the Air Force must meet certain budget reductions by the end of the fiscal year. Lt Gen (ret) Jameson commented that the Air Force has a \$12.4 billion shortfall for FY 2013. Mr. Ginsberg explained that with sequestration, every program is cut across the Board with the limited exception of certain protected areas such as military personnel accounts.

Next, Dr. Mueh briefed highlights from the athletic department. Specifically, Dr. Mueh shared that men's soccer won the Mountain Pacific Sports Federation; both the indoor and outdoor men's title in track and field; men's ice hockey advanced to the Atlantic Hockey Association quarterfinals; football played in their 6th consecutive bowl game; men's gymnastics ranked 1st for the 3rd year in a row; and USAFA won their 3rd straight conference sportsman of the year award.

Chairman Sandoval applauded the athletic department efforts before the meeting was adjourned.

(The meeting adjourned at 5:11 p.m.)

SUPERINTENDENT'S UPDATE

Chairman Sandoval called the meeting to order at 9:00 AM on 16 March and announced that the next order of business would be the Superintendent's update.

Lt Gen Gould explained that he would present some challenges, successes, and provide a snapshot of USAFA's future to the Board. Lt Gen Gould began with cadet challenges, and shared an unfortunate cadet loss and discussed a recent "cadet save". He reiterated that USAFA's emphasis must be on identifying distressed cadets.

Next, Lt Gen Gould discussed the effects of sequestration and explained USAFA is expecting \$10-12 million in cuts to the Operations and Maintenance (O&M) funds. Lt Gen (ret) Jameson shared his outrage for sequestration and the impacts it will have in the war zone and pilot training hours. Mr. Wiley commented that he is hopeful that when the government looks at priorities, the military, and specifically the Air Force Academy, will be properly prioritized. Congressman Lamborn agreed and Lt Gen Gould provided the Board with specific impacts of O&M reductions including: 20% cut in civilian pay for the next 6 months, 18% reduction in flying hours that would lead to two-thirds of the entire Air Force's flying unit being noncombat ready by summer, Air Force tiered readiness, etc.

Mr. Ginsberg shared his thoughts on the effects of sequestration. He reiterated that approximately 180,000 civilians may be impacted by a 20% reduction in salary, reduced retirement contributions, and leave accrual. Additionally, he said that would affect the number of hours civilian employees are working on the days they are not furloughed, limiting their time to 8 hours per day. Mr. Ginsberg noted that the impact would be far reaching and military personnel would be impacted by the cuts to programs like tuition assistance, Airman Family Readiness Centers, etc.

Maj Gen (ret) Harris asked if the cuts would be retroactive and Lt Gen Jones explained that it would not be retroactive and that sequestration is different than a lapse in appropriations. Lt Gen Gould shared USAFA actions to date (i.e. discontinued work on some Fix USAFA projects, cut back on faculty development and recruiting, etc.) to prepare USAFA for the cuts to O&M discretionary funds. Lt Gen Gould pointed out that the Army and Navy cuts are even tougher than the Air Force's reductions. He said that the goal is to decrease enough now to still conduct cadet summer academics, military, airmanship, and athletic training.

Next, Lt Gen Gould discussed the USAFA health and welfare inspection in response to Gen Welsh's guidance to review the environment in which people work. Lt Gen (ret) Jameson asked if USAFA differentiated between cadet areas and the rest of the Academy grounds and Lt Gen Gould responded that the inspection was across the board. Lt Gen (ret) Jameson noted that Gen Welsh called every Air Force wing commander to Washington last year, and talked to them for a full day about the Air Force environment to ensure that this topic is not taken lightly.

Lt Gen Gould discussed the admissions process and commented that of the 570 appointed offers for the class of 2017 there was not one first-generation college candidate and the distribution of family income did not have a lot of diversity. He said that for USAFA to diversify, the Congressional nominations must be more diverse.

Lt Gen Gould updated the Board on the Air Force Academy Athletic Corporation (AFAAC) and said ideally the corporation would be running by 1 July 2013. He shared that with sequestration and tight budgets; AFAAC provides an opportunity to make money in USAFA athletic endeavors. Lt Gen Gould pointed out that Mr. Ginsberg and Air Force General Council will work through the remaining issues and Mr. Ginsberg stated that they do have a way ahead. He shared that the fundamental athletic needs of cadets will be supported through AFAAC. In addition, the relationship will contribute to Academy long term growth. Lt Gen Jameson asked if it would change the Board of Visitors relationship with the athletic director and Mr. Ginsberg explained that the BoV responsibility would remain the same and they would continue to focus on the health, morale, and welfare of USAFA cadets.

Chairman Sandoval asked if Mr. Ginsberg felt that an individual from AFAAC would come and brief the Board and Mr. Ginsberg replied that they could be invited to present. Lt Gen Gould noted that USAFA has complete oversight of AFAAC. Mr. Ginsberg shared that AFAAC will present to the Board once the vision and operating intent is sorted out to ensure that the BoV is able to analyze the physical training, and the intercollegiate work of cadets.

Lt Gen Gould announced that Maj Gen Michelle Johnson had been nominated to the rank of Lieutenant General and USAFA Superintendent. He said Maj Gen Johnson would be coming from Supreme Headquarters Allied Powers Europe (SHAPE) and that the change in command would take place 9 August 2013. Lt Gen Gould shared news on Brigadier General select Tim Gibson and Major General select Greg Lengyel who would likely remain at USAFA for at least another cycle.

Lt Gen Gould announced that the USAFA diversity plan had been published, and commented on the hard work of the USAFA diversity team. He explained that the next phase would be the implementation and Chairman Sandoval asked if the diversity plan was downloadable. Lt Gen Gould replied that he would get the information out to the Board. Lt Gen Gould shared a few cadet highlights including: approximately 4,000 cadets participated in religious training and respect; powered flight team won their

26th regional championship; cadets marched in the inaugural parade in Washington, D.C.; celebration of 100th night; and strong cadet athletes in tennis and basketball. Lt Gen Gould mentioned the resilience of the USAFA flying team due to major air space changes and said that the USAFA prep school had done an outstanding job with the Combined Federal Campaign.

Next, Lt Gen Gould updated the Board on the National Character and Leadership Symposium (NCLS), and Chairman Sandoval encouraged all Board members to attend during their time on the BoV. Lt Gen Gould shared the cadet's work with science, technology, engineering and math (STEM) outreach and provided the Board with an update on the Chinese delegation visit to the Academy.

Finally, Lt Gen Gould updated the Board on the Dean of Faculty selection process. He shared that the Secretary of the Air Force drove the selection process and USAFA interviewed 10 candidates from the 64 applications received. Lt Gen Gould noted that a nomination is headed forward to the SECAF. Maj Gen (Ret) Harris asked if USAFA has ever had a civilian Dean and Lt Gen Gould replied that USAFA has never had a civilian in that position.

Chairman Sandoval announced a 5 minute break before the Board went into a closed session.

(The open session dismissed at 10:08 a.m.)

CHARACTER UPDATE BRIEF (CLOSED SESSION)

Brig Gen Lengyel provided an update on cadet disciplinary issues during this closed session.

(The closed session ended and the open session reconvened at 11:48 a.m.)

IMPACT OF NDAA REQUIREMENTS

Chairman Sandoval welcomed everyone back to the open session and shared that the next presentation would be from Col Barzler and Col Renner on the impact of National Defense Authorization Act (NDAA) of 2013 requirements. Col Barzler explained the NDAA requires that all unit commanders conduct a unit climate assessment within 120 days of taking command, as well as ensuring the unit climate assessment includes an opportunity for service members to opine on the effectiveness of the commanders' action in receiving and acting on complaints.

Col Renner explained that on the cadet side, a permanent party survey had been given with each incoming commandant. The cadet squadrons have an EO-conducted climate assessment as well as the Defense Manpower Data Center survey, and Service Academy gender relations survey conducted every 2 years. Mr. Ginsberg asked if that survey was released in December and Col Renner confirmed the December release. Mr. Ginsberg clarified that the climate assessment is conducted every two years as part of an Air Force Instruction (AFI) requirement. Col Renner confirmed and added that the survey is directed by the Superintendent.

Next, Mr. Ginsberg asked if we have the baseline climate assessments that every Air Force unit undertakes and Col Renner replied that USAFA has not been doing the baseline assessments. She explained that USAFA has to be careful of the rules that are in place with the DoD survey since you are not allowed to ask similar questions in other survey instruments.

Brig Gen (Ret) Ms. Thornhill asked if the USAFA population is over-surveyed and Col Renner replied that they are surveyed frequently. Mr. Ginsberg pointed out that all the surveys cadets participate in are not the same. He said in addition to the legislative and Air Force headquarters mandated studies, teachers conduct ad hoc surveys, so if you want to make sure that cadets complete a survey, you need to have the Superintendent point out that the particular survey is important. Mr. Ginsberg pointed out that offering surveys strategically is important to eliminate survey fatigue among participants.

Maj Gen (Ret) Harris asked about the development of survey instruments and Col Renner replied USAFA builds many surveys in house; however the unit climate assessment and the Defense Manpower Data Center survey are built outside of USAFA. Col Barzler noted that USAFA has been fulfilling NDAA requirements since 2004.

Col Barzler explained that section 573 of the NDAA requires a special victim's capability and Chairman Sandoval asked if victims will be given an Air Force lawyer or a civilian lawyer. Col Barzler said that victims are given an Air Force lawyer. He shared that USAFA has gone beyond the NDAA requirements and established a special victims counsel, trained 60 Air Force JAs, and will continue to grow this program in the future. Mr. Ginsberg asked about the benefits of the program and Col Barzler replied that the strength is giving victims the opportunity to develop an attorney/client relationship.

Mr. Ginsberg confirmed that this is a pilot program and other services are not going into the level of depth as USAFA. Chairman Sandoval asked if a victim could hire outside council and Col Barzler confirmed that they may.

Next, Lt Gen Jones commented that the term "victim advocate" has morphed and now NDAA requires a Sexual Assault Response Coordinator (SARC) and a victim advocate to complete 40 hours of training. Mr. Ginsberg stated that the Air Force is going to the model that USAFA currently has in place.

Mr. Ginsberg shared that the Air Force has focused on providing victims what they need from a legal standpoint. He said that although sexual assault issues are rare, the Air Force wants victims to feel comfortable to come forward. Maj Gen (Ret) Harris asked if there were trends among the accused perpetrators and Col Barzler replied that there is limited commonality among the USAFA cases. Lt Gen Jones added that Air Force sexual assault is typically blue on blue and for the most part; the cases they see are individuals with boundary issues.

(The NDAA presentation ended and the Board went straight into sub-committee outbriefs.)

SUB-COMMITTEE OUTBRIEFS

Chairman Sandoval gave the subcommittee outbrief and shared that the Board discussed the need to change the subcommittee structure. He shared that the BoV will have one strategic subcommittee and one super committee with all BoV members. Chairman Sandoval explained that in the past there have not been a sufficient number of BoV members to cover all the subcommittees properly; therefore the super committee will address all issues of concern. Chairman Sandoval shared that the subcommittees also discussed sexual assault and suicide issues at USAFA, as well as the transition to the new Superintendent. He noted that for the June BoV, USAFA senior staff will VTC or teleconference into the meeting due to severe budget issues. Chairman Sandoval mentioned that the Board discussed General Welsh's directive to review USAFA and commented that this issue would be worked with the new Superintendent as well.

Chairman Sandoval reminded the Board that the next meeting would take place 13 and 14 June in Washington, DC and asked the BoV members to stay for an administrative session.

(The proceedings were adjourned at 12:29 p.m.)


LAMONT A. COLEMAN, Lt Col, USAF
Executive Secretary


ALFREDO A. SANDOVAL
Chair, USAFA Board of Visitors

**The US Air Force Academy (USAFA)
Board of Visitors (BOV) Meeting Minutes
14 June 2013 / 0800 – 1700**

Russell Senate Office Building, SR-485 in Washington D.C.

This report and the recommendations contained herein are based upon the Board of Visitors' independent assessment of the facts presented by the Department of the Air Force and The US Air Force Academy. Any Board of Visitors' recommendations are based upon the consensus opinion of the members, and were reached without any influence from interested parties. Board of Visitors members, if they disagree with the majority position, are encouraged to submit Minority Statements and, when submitted, they are attached to the final Board of Visitors' report for consideration by the Department of the Air Force.

Section I: Board Attendance

Section II: Board Activities and Discussions

Section III: Board Actions

Section IV: Board Requests, Observations, and Recommendations



Alfredo A. Sandoval

Chair, USAFA Board of Visitors

November 15, 2013

Attachments:

1. Board of Visitors Tracking Matrix
2. Board of Visitors Slide Deck

Section I: Board Attendance

Members Present:

- Mr. Alfredo Sandoval (Chair)
- Lieutenant General (Ret) Arlen "Dirk" Jameson (Vice Chair)
- Representative Jared Polis (D-CO)
- Representative Doug Lamborn (R-CO)
- Representative Niki Tsongas (D-MA)
- Maj General (Ret) Marcelite Harris
- Dr. Thomas McKiernan
- Mr. Fletcher "Flash" Wiley
- Brigadier General (Ret) Dr. Paula Thornhill
- Ms. Sue Hoppin

Members Absent:

- Senator Lindsey Graham (R- SC)
- Senator Michael Bennet (D-CO)
- Senator John Hoeven (R-ND)
- Representative Loretta Sanchez (D-CA)

Air Force Senior Staff:

- Honorable Daniel Ginsberg, SAF/MR
- Lieutenant General Frank Gorenc, AF/CVA
- Lieutenant General Darrell Jones, AF/A1
- Ms. Francine Blackmon, SES, USAFA BoV Designated Federal Official (DFO)

USAFA Senior Staff:

- Lieutenant General Michael Gould, Superintendent
- Brigadier General Greg Lengyel, Commandant of Cadets
- Brigadier General Dana Born, Dean of the Faculty
- Colonel Tamara Rank, Vice Superintendent

BoV Executive Secretary:

- Lieutenant Colonel LaMont Coleman (AF/A1PT)
- Major Mark Cipolla (AF/A1PT)
- Dr. Thomas Langdon, GS-15, USAFA BoV Alt DFO

Section II: Board Activities and Discussions

- The US Air Force Academy (USAFA) Board of Visitors (BOV) meeting convened at 10:00AM on 14 June 2013 in the Russell Senate Office Building, SR-485, Washington D.C. Mr. Alfredo Sandoval chaired the meeting, open to the public, and was advertised in the Federal Register on 28 May 2013 (Vol. 78, No. 102). Ms. Francine Blackmon, Designated Federal Officer, was present and a quorum was met.
- Prior to the official proceedings, Mr. Ginsberg presented the Commander's Public Service Award to former board member Mr. Robert "Robin" Hayes. Mr. Hayes provided comments of gratitude to the board and appreciation.

- Mr. Sandoval called the meeting to order. Previous meeting minutes for March 2013 BoV were brought to the table for a vote and were approved with no opposition. Air Force senior staff was invited to offer any initial comments. Lieutenant General Gorenc stated he was honored to represent the Air Force Chief of Staff and looked forward to the discussion. Mr. Sandoval invited Lt Gen Gould to proceed with the Superintendent Update.
- **Superintendent's Update**
 - Prior to the start of the Superintendent's Update, Lt Gen Gould described the ongoing wild fires in the Colorado Springs area which destroyed over 350 homes but did not directly affect the Academy and Peterson AFB area. Over 700 people were evacuated from their homes and there were two deaths associated with fire; however, they were not members of the USAFA family.
 - Lt Gen Gould reflected on his 38 plus years of USAF experience to reflect how far we have come and began his brief with an update on the recent USAFA graduation. Although the Thunderbirds were missed, The Texas Flying Legends volunteered to support the cadets with a fly over of B25s, P55s and P47s.
 - He provided a statistical comparison of graduations from 2010 to 2013 highlighting both an increase and decrease in the selection of specific AFSCs. For example there was a significant decline in Combat Systems Officer, Air Battle Manager and Airfield Operations. With over 1,350 graduates in 2013. Lt Gen Gould was concerned that only 50% of incoming class (class of 2017) entered the Academy Potentially Pilot Qualified (PPQ). Mr. Wiley asked why cadets are volunteering for rated positions at a lower rate. Brig Gen Lengyel, Commandant of Cadets, stated the academy is researching the topic.
 - Historically, USAFA was achieving 65% eligibility rates; however, recently that has dropped to 50% due to a decrease in the PPQ rate. Lt Gen Jones asked if USAFA is looking into opening Falcon Foundation to more than just pilots. According to Lt Gen Gould, USAFA will be looking into many options.
 - Lt Gen Gould continued with his briefing. Civilian furlough is a budget challenge with 1,500 civilians impacted; \$4.2 million in lost pay--average; faculty \$1,860/non-faculty \$1,113
 - Quite a bit of USAFA leadership turn-over this summer. Col Tamara Rank retired last week replaced by Col Evan Miller (Vice Superintendent). Brig Gen Dana Born retiring replaced by Col Andy Armacost next week (Dean of Faculty). Col Tim Gibson retiring will be replaced by Col Stacey Hawkins (10 ABW CC) and Col Mark Dierlam, HAF USAFA Liaison, will be replaced by Col Allen Hess
 - The Character and Leadership Development Project started in Jan 13 and as of this BoV was approximately 9.5% complete with an expected completion date of Sep 14.

- The AF Academy Athletic Corporation (AFAAC) just received tax exemption. AFAAC is a nonprofit business model which compliments the strategic fundraising for the USAFA Endowment with the potential to grow new revenue streams. AFAAC contact list will be provided to Mr. Wiley per his request. Mr. Ginsberg provided the board with further details to explain how this program will be carried out and the necessary steps in order to protect any and all controversies. Currently, USAFA along with SAF/MR and SAF/GC assisted in developing language to amend current law regarding Academy Athletic Programs, Subsection (e) of 4 Section 528 of the National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 2010. This legislation is needed to modify the authority for support for the Air Force. It basically covers three specific areas which are 1) Acceptance of Support; 2) Leases, Contracts, Grants and Cooperative Agreements; 3) Trademarks/Service Marks. Congresswoman Tsongas asked why legislation is the deciding factor. Response was that it's a formality to clarify expenses. Maj Gen (ret) Harris asked for clarification on the correlation between the board members, USAFA, and legislation. Ms. Hoppin asked who would one contact for donations. Mr. Sandoval stated more on this topic would be discussed during the end of session administration period upon the departure of USAFA personnel.
- USAFA Endowment is working toward a project to renovate Falcon Stadium. It has been about 50 years since this stadium has been updated. Construction is on track to begin in Dec 14 with the goal of creating an environment to build and improve morale while influencing increased attendance. This will be done all with donated funds (~\$60-80 million).
- Lt Gen Gould addressed several ongoing programs such as Polaris Warrior which is an annual combat skills competition. The Summer Military Training activities have had challenges given high temperatures. These programs have also been affected by sequestration but continue to offer the cadets experiences during the summer. DACOWITS visit occurred in early Apr 13, and the informal out brief was very positive; awaiting formal out brief.
- 2013 Warrior Games have become the venue for many major events for wounded warriors. Two-hundred and sixty (260) veterans competed this year and Prince Harry participated and spoke to wounded warriors. Prince Harry's presence has brought international media coverage/spotlight.
- Character of Leadership and Development is a meaningful event for all cadets. Cadets paid their own way to Florida to honor the Doolittle Raiders reunion. Lt Gen Gorenc and Mr Sandoval provided comments on the fund based reunion for such an emotional event. Final toast will be in November with a slight adjustment to include 3 (of the 4 remaining) vets to take the toast together.
- LT Gen Gould provided selected statistics on the USAFA Class of 2017. Target was 1,180, and USAFA was very close to meeting it with 1,179. While reviewing the slides, Mr. Sandoval commented that diversity is more than race. He went on to point out that USAFA has the largest African American numbers

he had seen; very impressive because this segment is the hardest to recruit.

- Lt Gen Gould commented on graduation numbers, looking at 2013 and 2010, USAFA graduation numbers decreased from previous years to 1024 and 999, respectfully. The graduation numbers for 2014 and 2015 will be even lower to maintain less than the HAF-mandated 4,000 cadets.
- Lt Gen Jones asked about the projected accessions guidance quotas and Lt Gen Gould stated the USAFA target was 528 for pilots. Lt Gen Jones then asked what has caused the decrease in pilot volunteers and what could be done. Lt Gen Jones asked USAFA to attempt to increase their applicants. Lt Gen (ret) Jameson asked if pilot qualified Cadets are electing not to be pilots and the answer was yes. Lt Gen Gould stated this was the first year USAFA has not met its rated goal. His concern is that only about 50% of the incoming class was Potentially Pilot Qualified. We are however working on modifying the syllabus to have early courses in aviation to create a greater awareness. Lt Gen Gould went on to say the cadets need to see those aviators in the hallways and classroom. They need role models early on to mold their desires. Lt Gen (ret) Jameson asked if USAFA was meeting Air Force pilot quotas and Lt Gen Gould stated that yes they were; however, they will work with Lt Gen Jones on getting qualified numbers and number of pilots. CM Polis asked if USAFA's work and outreach for recruiting is having a positive impact on diversity. Lt Gen Gould stated they are very active; however, certain districts of Congress do not nominate or the nominations are minimal. Mr. Sandoval stated that 187 districts do not nominate at all. Demographics (as of May 30) was presented and discussed among the BoV. This was the first year USAFA was below the target number for pilots. For USAFA production purposes however, they are meeting the needs of the USAF. Congress is looking into information to provide better impact to the needs of the USAF throughout each district with the US.

- **Character Update (CLOSED SESSION)**

- **Diversity Inclusion Plan**

- Dr. Jack Wilks provided a brief to the BoV outlining USAFA's Diversity Inclusion Plan that was signed by the superintendent in April 2013. The plan was constructed using a phased approach. Phase I included strategic planning using foundational documents such as Government-wide Diversity and Inclusion Plan from 2011, Air Force Policy Directives, and the Air Force Strategic Diversity Roadmap. Phase II involved developing the Diversity Plan Assessment and Reporting Annex with Phase III being the reporting measurement and reporting mechanisms. . Additional details are located in the attached slides.
- Mr. Sandoval made a point that working on creating environment where all diverse individuals can reach goal is everyone's responsibility and lauded the plan. Maj Gen (ret) Harris asked for clarity on the overall goal. Dr. Wilks, USAFA, stated that ultimately the action plan is to support strategic plan and produce the best officer that embodies core concepts in Air Expeditionary Force with diverse competition. He went on to say that it is difficult to narrow down to

one goal or outcome. Maj Gen (ret) Harris said she thought we were looking for a "reflection of our US diversity". Dr. Wilks responded by saying that USAFA was working on broadening to increase group diversity.

- Mr. Sandoval made further comments on D&I Plan. The goal ultimately is to produce the best United States officers to lead and command in a globalized, Air and Space World. The question was asked "what is the goal" by Maj Gen (Ret) Harris. We desire for everyone to view USAFA as another great opportunity for employment, there are at least six specific goals. We desire for our applicant pool to be very wide spread to recruit on the best and brightest individual's for today's USAF.

- **Development of a USAFA Second Lieutenant—Part 2**

- The floor was turned over to Col Joe Sanders, Director, Center for Character and Leadership Development (CCLD), to discuss progress and programs. He went on to describe authorities to which USAFA subscribes. Department of Defense Directive 1322.22, Service Academies, provides the overall direction on the foundational mission of Service Academies which are to produce career-motivated officers who are immersed in traditions and professional values essential to the US Armed Forces; experienced in an intense professional military environment embracing values, attitudes and traditions.
- According to Lt Col Basik, USAFA pursues this mission with the Officer Development System. This system is designed to organize cadet experiences to achieve goals and mission by ensuring cadet development aligns with Air Force Institutional Competencies and USAFA institutional outcome. The competencies develop progressively across all levels of leadership using the Personal, Interpersonal, Team and Organizational (PITO) concept.
- Lt Col Basik went on to cover how USAFA ensures cadets are provided comprehensive education and training as required in Air Force Directive 1-1, Leadership and Force Development. A military officer has the responsibilities as a warfighter, servant of the Nation, a member of the profession of arms and a leader of character to live honorably, lift others through support and development, and elevate performance toward a common purpose.
- Col Sanders explained how USAFA develops leaders of character. They deliver this through experiences that focus what it means to live honorably through the consistent practices of virtues embodied in the Air Force Core Values; lifting others to their best possible selves, and elevating performance toward a common and noble purpose. This is done progressively over the course of their 4-years using the aforementioned PITO process.
- Mr. Wiley stated that USAFA has 4 years to develop cadets. What kind of character development do we have to conduct to ensure all cadets (ROTC and USAFA) are to the same level? A follow up question from Brig Gen (ret) Thornhill was "What do we need to do to develop a 2Lt?" Is there a cheaper way to do so? Both Brig Gen (ret) Thornhill and Maj Gen (ret) Harris agreed that

changing the USAFA curriculum and providing more tools for longevity may be needed as many leave earlier than expected even though so much effort was put into development. Others added to the discussion such as "Why did they leave?" Is it because of money? They leave but what we want is a leader in the military. Lt Gen (ret) Jameson stated that they got their money and left. It's not about who pays but why they leave. He stated many come because they want to play Division 1 sports; however, that is not the reason we want them. Mr. Wiley countered by saying that even though they leave doesn't mean they do not become leaders in our nation. He stated that many only may stay for 5 or 6 years and leave but rise to significant and successful leadership positions within industry or government with many giving back much more than given. Lt Gen Jones followed on by stating that life situations change and motivation change ... we can try surveying to determine why some leave but individual don't always want to share "why". Life is easier for some in the military and others think "the grass is greener" out.

- Lt Gen Gorenc finalized all comments to explain how in fact character development is steadily improving. We are growing leaders for America and all do not stay. However, this development mechanism provides citizens who are better as a result of USAFA's efforts. You can have character but you need dedication and warrior spirit. Re-examining the requirements for this process is still an ongoing battle and that should be considered.

- **Subcommittee Out Brief**

- Mr. Sandoval asked for a comprehensive brief on the new Non-Profit AF Academy Athletic Corporation at the next BoV. In addition, he asked USAFA to continue to develop metrics on the quality of USAFA graduates. With regard to Character Updates Sessions (CLOSED), the request was made to expand data collection that could be reported to the Board.

- **Board of Visitors Annual Ethics Training**

- Michelle Simms, Director, Air Force Ethics Office (Fiscal, Ethics & Administrative Law) provided annual ethics training for all BoV members. The training included the following topics with specific details contained in the attached slides:
 - AF Ethic Principles
 - Federal Administrative Advisory Committee explanation
 - Understanding Special Government Employee (SGE) status
 - Relevant Rules
 - Criminal conflict of interest statutes
 - Administrative regulations

- **Closing comments**

- Mr. Sandoval thanked everyone for their participation in the discussion. Mr. Ginsberg and Lt Gen Gorenc echoed his comments and felt that it was a very

productive day.

- On an administrative note, Mr. Sandoval asked that the Board Secretariat provide the read-ahead information as soon as possible and when the minutes are produced would like the newly developed BoV Tracking Matrix and slides to all open sessions be made part of the minutes.

Section III: Board Actions

- Mr. Sandoval stated the BoV will continue to refine the BoV Action Tracker/Matrix and will use this tool to maintain focus.

Section IV: Board Requests, Observations, and Recommendations

- None